



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

wise unknown features of primitive Christian tradition. Whatever is to be said in favor of locating Golgotha north of Jerusalem, certainly no critical value can be attached to the alleged Essene manuscript.

SHIRLEY JACKSON CASE

THE UNIVERSITY OF CHICAGO

NEW TESTAMENT TEACHING ABOUT RESURRECTION

Professor Bowen writes a valuable book¹ on a subject which is deeply in need of more intelligent treatment. The subject is too complex and obscure to permit the expectation that any author will give full and equal satisfaction at every point, but Professor Bowen's book is on the whole a luminous and welcome contribution.

The strongest feature of the discussion is perhaps its presentation of the radical difference between Paul's view of the resurrection of Jesus and that which is most conspicuous in the Gospels. Paul witnesses to experiences and convictions of the disciples, while the Gospels witness to *post-mortem* acts of Jesus. With Paul the rising of Jesus is always from among the souls of the dead, in the Gospels it is from the grave. What Paul contended against in Corinth was essentially that view which later found expression in all the gospels and which has dominated Christian thought to the present. Paul's witness to the resurrection of Jesus is treated as fundamental. Then follows a discussion of Mark's data. Mark 14:28 is regarded as an interpolation, and the episode of the women at the grave owes its origin wholly to pious imagination. As to the empty grave, the whole course of events is held to be strongly against its probability. "It was not the three women on the morning of the third day who discovered the empty tomb: it was the Christian church about the year sixty." The empty tomb was the inference from the materialization of the original spiritual thought of resurrection. "Mark 16:1-8 is as truly a legend as the grotesque picture of Pseudo-Peter."

Professor Bowen regards Matthew's conception of the exact time of the resurrection as "psychologically and dramatically more true" than that of Mark. He admits that Matthew's note of time, read literally, puts the visit of the women *before* Sunday, but holds nevertheless that he meant to express by it Sunday morning. Matt. 28:9-10 are an interpolation. They break the connection and are in every

¹ *The Resurrection in the New Testament. An Examination of the Earliest References to the Rising of Jesus and of Christians from the Dead.* By Clayton R. Bowen. New York: Putnam, 1911. 490 pages. \$1.75.

respect a disturbing element. The story of Matt. 28:11-15 is, of course, held to be utterly impossible. Matt. 28:16 is understood to refer to the mountain where Jesus had chosen his apostles. The author, however, does not suggest why the disciples should have gone to that particular spot to await the fulfilment of the promise that the risen Lord would appear to them in Galilee. The Emmaus episode is Luke's own construction, and "designed to set forth the thought that the Christian movement which eventuated in the world-church of the second century did not go out altogether or chiefly from the twelve apostles." In Luke's account of the appearance to the Eleven "every shred of historicity is lost in the urgency of the apologetic need." The Johannine story of the resurrection does not contain any historical element. This position is justified both by the character of the Fourth Gospel as a whole and also by the study of the narrative itself. Historical fact can be predicated of only two of the appearances of Jesus recorded in the Gospels, and as these were both in Galilee, Galilee is regarded as the birthplace of the church.

This brief sketch merely affords the reader a glimpse at the trend and quality of Professor Bowen's book. One could desire, let it be said in closing, that the results of this study, stripped of all technical details, might be brought to the attention of Christian people in general.

GEORGE HOLLEY GILBERT

DORSET, VT.

A NEW MANUAL OF EARLY CHURCH HISTORY

The student of church history certainly cannot complain of the lack of manuals in his field; on the contrary, he is confronted rather with an embarrassment of riches. With the *Moeller von Schubert*, the *Kurtz*, the *Karl Mueller*, the *Heussi*, the *Newman*, etc., before him, his problem is one of choice rather than search. To complicate this problem comes under the editorship of Professor Gustav Krüger of the University of Giessen yet another manual differentiating itself from its predecessors by being of a co-operative character. Following on the third part, there has now appeared the first part, covering from the beginnings to the end of the seventh century.¹ This section of the

¹ *Handbuch der Kirchengeschichte für Studierende*, in Verbindung mit Gerhard Ficker in Kiel, Heinrich Hermelink in Thekla bei Leipzig, Erwin Preuschen in Hirschhorn, Horst Stephan in Marburg, herausgegeben von Gustav Krüger in Giessen. Erster Teil, *Das Altertum*. Bearbeitet von D. Dr. Erwin Preuschen, Pfarrer in Hirschhorn a. N., und D. Dr. Gustav Krüger, Professor in Giessen. Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr (Paul Siebeck), 1911. xiv+295 pages. M.5.